

**MINUTES OF THE 42<sup>nd</sup> ENAAEE  
ADMINISTRATIVE COUNCIL MEETING  
14 March 2017, 10.30-15.00 hrs  
ENAAEE premises, Brussels**

**42AC/265A**  
Status: 20 June 2017

A/D		By
	<p><b>Present:</b></p> <p><u>Chair:</u> Prof. Bernard REMAUD – President</p> <p><u>Members:</u> Mr. Ralph APPEL Mr. Dirk BOCHAR – Vice President (VP) Mr. Denis MCGRATH – Vice President (VP) Prof. Sergey SHAPOSHNIKOV Prof. Alfredo SQUARZONI Prof. Birgul TANTEKIN-ESOLMAZ</p> <p><u>Secretary:</u> Ms. Rita HEISSNER</p>	
	<p><b>1. Opening and Welcome</b></p> <p>The President opened the meeting and welcomed the participants.</p>	
	<p><b>2. Apologies for Absence</b></p> <p>Apologies from Prof. C. BORRI, Mr. M. BRIDGEFOOT and Prof. A.M. JOLLY-LEBRUN were <b>noted</b>.</p>	
	<p><b>3. Approval of the Draft Agenda</b> <b>247A</b></p>	
1.	The draft agenda was <b>approved</b> without modifications.	AC
	<p><b>4. Approval of the Minutes of the Past Meeting</b> <b>245</b></p>	
2.	The minutes from the past meeting on 21 November 2016 were <b>approved</b> without modifications.	AC
	<p><b>5. Review of the A/D List</b> <b>246A</b></p>	
3.	<i>A/D 4 of 39<sup>th</sup> meeting/ENAAEE membership:</i> it was <b>agreed</b> to continue ENAAEE membership in EASPA and IFEEES.	AC
4.	<i>Item 8 of the 40<sup>th</sup> meeting/ENAAEE website and EUR-ACE database (googlefriendliness):</i> Mr. D. McGRATH informed that a next status report from the IT company about the ongoing work is expected in the next days. It was <b>agreed</b> that he will circulate the report to the AC members for information.	McGrath
	<i>Item 16 of the 41<sup>st</sup> meeting/cooperation with IEA:</i> Mr. D. McGRATH suggested that FEANI could address with the IEA the subject of “Competences of Professional Engineers”. This was <b>noted</b> .	

**MINUTES OF THE 42<sup>nd</sup> ENAAEE  
ADMINISTRATIVE COUNCIL MEETING  
14 March 2017, 10.30-15.00 hrs  
ENAAEE premises, Brussels**

**42AC/265A**  
Status: 20 June 2017

A/D		By
5.	<p><i>Item 19 and 20 of the 40<sup>th</sup> meeting/FEANI-ENAAEE database:</i> as Mr. M. BRIDGEFOOT is travelling until the end of May, it was <b>agreed</b> that Prof. A. SQUARZONI will join the project as an additional ENAAEE representative.</p>	Squarzoni
6.	<p><i>Item 4 of the 41<sup>st</sup> meeting/ provision taken in 2015:</i> with reference to the minutes of the 2016 GA, it had already been <b>agreed</b> last November that the provision of EUR 20k, taken in the 2015 Results for the past SPREAD and EUGENE projects, will be re-injected in the 2018 Budget (not in the 2017 Budget).</p> <p>The other A/Ds were <b>noted</b> as either completed or included on this meeting agenda.</p>	AC, Treasurer
6.	<p><b>ENAAEE Strategy Review (SC meeting of 31 January 2017) 260</b></p>	
7.	<p>The PRESIDENT introduced the document “<i>Policy review of ENAAEE</i>”. He referred to his report to the ENAAEE GA on 22 November 2016 and to a recent review of the previous ENAAEE SWOT analysis based on a Business Analysis document (Situation – Objectives – Strategy – Tactics – Actions and Control). The AC <b>noted</b> the recommendations from the strategy meeting of the Standing Committee (SC) on 31 January 2017 and <b>agreed</b> unanimously with the principles of the Policy as presented.</p>	AC, President
8.	<p>Mr. D. BOCHAR volunteered to make editorial changes to spell out the objectives of the paper. This was <b>agreed</b>. [The revised document is reproduced in Annex I to the minutes of the afternoon session with FEANI representatives, document 42AC/266].</p> <p>Mr. D. McGRATH felt that members should be encouraged to propose new and more candidates for AC vacancies when ENAAEE takes over AC members’ travel costs, as proposed in the Policy. ENAAEE should be mindful of succession.</p> <p>Prof. A. SQUARZONI considered that ENAAEE should address the European and worldwide trend of institutional accreditation. ENAAEE should reflect on procedures to authorize agencies to accredit HEIs. Promotion to employers would be important, which could be done in partnership with FEANI. He proposed to set up a “EUR-ACE community of accredited study programmes”.</p> <p>Mr. R. APPEL observed an important decrease in the demand for programme accreditation in Germany. He stated that larger universities would tend to prefer institutional accreditation rather than accreditation by programme or faculties.</p> <p>Prof. B. TANTEKIN ERSOLMAZ highlighted the value of the EUR-ACE label and programme accreditation. Institutional accreditation could complement programme accreditation.</p>	Bochar
9.	<p>Above remarks were <b>noted</b>. It was <b>agreed</b> that a WG would be set up addressing the subject of “institutional accreditation”.</p>	President

**MINUTES OF THE 42<sup>nd</sup> ENAAEE  
ADMINISTRATIVE COUNCIL MEETING  
14 March 2017, 10.30-15.00 hrs  
ENAAEE premises, Brussels**

**42AC/265A**  
Status: 20 June 2017

A/D	<p><b>7. Financial matters</b></p> <p><b>7.1 Financial Results 2016</b> <b>248</b></p> <p>Mr. D. BOCHAR introduced the Financial Results 2016 as prepared by the corporate Accountant. This shows a surplus of EUR 15.505,36. The following was <b>noted</b>:</p> <p>Income:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- EUR-ACE labels (EUR 56.550,-) are some EUR 10k below budget.</li> <li>- Final compensations for QUEECA were received after project termination and subsequent EU reimbursements to the project leader UNIFI (EUR 13k).</li> <li>- An extraordinary income (EUR 5k) was received from CLAIU after its dissolution.</li> </ul> <p>Expenses:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The costs related to the FEANI/ENAAEE Services Contract (EUR 51.790,-) were calculated on “pay per use”-basis and are some EUR 5k above budget.</li> <li>- IT costs cover website and database hosting, including the transfer to a new supplier. They are booked under “IT Costs” (EUR 9k) and “Depreciations” (EUR 7.694,-) vs. EUR 12.485,- budgeted under “Depreciations”</li> <li>- The costs for the anniversary conference event amounted to EUR 6k.</li> <li>- Bad debt provisions did not apply.</li> </ul> <p>The following was <b>noted</b>:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The overall income from EUR-ACE labels in the recent years has been fluctuating. In some countries, e.g. Turkey, the label awards are increasing, in others, e.g. Germany, a declining trend is seen in favour of institutional accreditation.</li> <li>- The surplus in 2016 relates particularly to a compensation from the QUEECA EU project running for several years.</li> <li>- A provision for the joint FEANI/ENAAEE database was already included in 2016 under “Depreciations”; this will be invoiced in March 2017 with the agreed total of EUR 7.500,- plus VAT, to be depreciated over three years.</li> </ul> <p>The financial results were <b>agreed</b> for presentation to the GA on 21 November 2017 for final approval, subject to confirmation by the Internal Auditor.</p> <p><b>7.2 Invoicing Plan 2017</b> <b>249</b></p> <p>The Invoicing Plan, status 7 March 2017, was <b>noted</b>. The secretariat follows up with the members where payment is not received yet.</p> <p><b>7.3 Activities and responsibilities in line with the Budget 2017</b></p> <p>The 2017 budget was approved by the ENAAEE GA on 22 November 2016. The AC <b>noted</b> that a new ENAAEE-FEANI “Service Agreement” is being proposed with a lump</p>	By
10.		AC, Treasurer, Bochar, Payzin

**MINUTES OF THE 42<sup>nd</sup> ENAAEE  
ADMINISTRATIVE COUNCIL MEETING  
14 March 2017, 10.30-15.00 hrs  
ENAAEE premises, Brussels**

**42AC/265A**  
Status: 20 June 2017

A/D	<p>sum of EUR 52k, in line with the approved budget and the actual costs invoiced in the past year (2016). This includes general office costs (EUR 12k), provisions for three regular ENAAEE AC or WG meetings held in the FEANI premises and 50% of the secretary's remuneration costs (EUR 40k). It was furthermore <b>agreed</b> to co-sponsor the 3<sup>rd</sup> European Engineers' Day on 5 October 2017 in Vienna, organized by FEANI, ECEC and ECCE, with EUR 2.500,-, ("promotion events").</p>	<b>By</b>
11.	<p><b>7.4 Increases in membership fees and EUR-ACE label fees as of 2018</b> <b>250</b></p> <p>The Standing Committee (SC) at its past meeting on 31 January proposed to increase ENAAEE membership fees and EUR-ACE label fees as of 2018. The PRESIDENT explained that the SC considered this necessary to address the situation of a tight and somewhat fluctuating ENAAEE annual budget, including a less optimistic trend for EUR-ACE labels. It also considered the costs for taking over AC members' travel expenses as per the "<i>Policy Review</i>" document. The AC <b>agreed</b> to propose to the GA the following increases:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- EUR-ACE label fees fees: 2.5% annually for the next 3 consecutive years, as of 2018.</li> <li>- ENAAEE membership fees (full and associate): 5% in 2018.</li> </ul>	Bochar
12.	<p><b>8. Network Matters</b></p> <p><b>8.1 Discussion topics of the joint ENAAEE-FEANI Board session</b> <b>247B</b></p> <p>The AC <b>noted</b> the agenda of the afternoon session, jointly with FEANI representatives.</p> <p><b>8.2 ENAAEE response to the FEANI document "Professional Status of the Engineer in Europe"</b> <b>263</b></p>	President, Treasurer
13.	<p>The FEANI European Monitoring Committee (EMC) had invited ENAAEE for comments to its paper entitled "<i>The professional status of the engineer in Europe</i>". The AC <b>agreed</b> to the "Note on the FEANI report" as prepared by the PRESIDENT, to be further discussed in the afternoon session with FEANI and reported in the minutes of that session (42AC/266).</p>	President
14.	<p><b>8.3 Memorandum of Affiliation with CHEA</b> <b>251</b></p> <p>The information about CHEA (Council for Higher Education Accreditation) International Quality Group (CIQG) membership was <b>noted</b>. It was <b>agreed</b> to mandate the Standing Committee to decide whether to proceed with the proposed MoA between ENAAEE and CIQG nor not.</p>	President, SC

**MINUTES OF THE 42<sup>nd</sup> ENAAEE  
ADMINISTRATIVE COUNCIL MEETING  
14 March 2017, 10.30-15.00 hrs  
ENAAEE premises, Brussels**

**42AC/265A**  
Status: 20 June 2017

A/D	9. Strategic Matters	By
15.	<p><b>9.1 Amendments to the ENAAEE Statutes and Bylaws</b> <b>252</b></p> <p>It was <b>agreed</b> that the AC at its meeting of 20 June 2017 will decide on any recommendations to the GA on 21 November 2017 for amendments in the Statutes and Bylaws.</p> <p><b>9.1.1 LC recommendation for a Change in the Bylaws (LC membership Rules)</b></p> <p>The LC CHAIR introduced the proposal made by the LC for the ENAAEE Bylaws Article B8 related to the Label Committee. The goal would be to clarify and update provisions in line with approved ENAAEE procedures. This relates to the durations of LC members' and LC Chair's mandates as well as the composition of the LC and the Review Teams. The recommendation was <b>noted</b> to be included in the review for GA recommendations at the AC on 20 June 2016.</p> <p><b>10. Projects, Committee Reports and Activities</b></p> <p><b>10.1 Topics from the past Label Committee Meeting (3-4/11/2016)</b></p> <p><b>10.1.1 LC recommendations on the Templates related to Agency Authorizations and Re-Authorizations</b> <b>253</b></p> <p>The LC Chair introduced the proposal for updating the following four LC Templates:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Application Form for Accreditation Agencies – Authorization to award the EUR-ACE label</li> <li>- Application Form for Accreditation Agencies – Re-Authorization to award the EUR-ACE label</li> <li>- Draft Template Report for Authorization (“Report to EUR-ACE Label Committee”)</li> <li>- Draft Template Report for Re-Authorization (“Report to EUR-ACE Label Committee”)</li> </ul> <p>He <b>noted</b> the purpose and major elements of these updates as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- complying with the “<i>EUR-ACE Framework Standards and Guidelines</i>” (EAFSG)</li> <li>- using separate templates for authorization and re-authorization, both for agency applications and for LC Review Teams (ERTs)</li> <li>- including the provisions of the document on “<i>Transnational Accreditation</i>”, approved by the GA in November 2016</li> <li>- including a link to the “<i>Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area</i>” (ESG)</li> </ul>	President, AC
16.	<p>Mr. D. McGRATH suggested to make a specific reference to the ENAAEE document on “<i>Transnational Accreditation</i>”. The AC unanimously <b>agreed</b> to the four documents, with the inclusion of the aforementioned reference.</p>	LC Chair

**MINUTES OF THE 42<sup>nd</sup> ENAAEE  
ADMINISTRATIVE COUNCIL MEETING  
14 March 2017, 10.30-15.00 hrs  
ENAAEE premises, Brussels**

A/D	10.1.2 LC recommendation for an update of the document on the “EUR-ACE Label Authorisation Process” 254	By
	<p>The LC Chair presented the amendments for an update of the ENAAEE document on the “<i>EUR-ACE Label Authorisation Process</i>”. He <b>noted</b> the elements, unanimously supported by LC members, as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- including the provisions of the document on “<i>Transnational Accreditation</i>”</li> <li>- incorporating the internal (table-format) procedures, schedules and deadlines for the secretariat and for agencies</li> <li>- including the provisions related to the LC Chair, LC members, ERT composition and processes</li> <li>- introducing a new “<i>Assessment of Review Process Form</i>” (360 degree)</li> <li>- maintaining the unanimity voting rule on authorizations and re-authorizations while introducing a new provision (§ 9.2) that “<i>in the case of EUR-ACE-authorization of an Agency in a country in which an authorized Agency already exists, the already authorized Agency should not participate in the LC vote on authorization</i>”.</li> </ul> <p>Mr. D. McGRATH felt that the system of unanimity should be preserved. He considered that the above new provision should be removed as it might have a negative impact with respect to the acceptance of ENAAEE’s Mutual Recognition Accord. In a subsequent vote, three AC members voted in favour of that proposal, three against and one abstained.</p>	
17.	<p>It was <b>agreed</b> to remove the phrase in § 9.2, to be reviewed again by LC. It was furthermore <b>agreed</b> to change in § 9.6 the wording “<i>...In authorizing for the first time an Agency to award the EUR-ACE label, ENAAEE can restrict the operations of the newly authorized Agency...</i>” to “<i>...may restrict...</i>”</p>	LC Chair
18.	<p>The AC <b>approved</b> the document “<i>EUR-ACE Label Authorisation Process</i>” accordingly.</p>	LC Chair
	<p><b>10.1.3 Preparations for a Members’ Forum in 2017</b> 255</p> <p>The PRESIDENT introduced the rationale, expected participation and potential topics for the ENAAEE Members’ Forum 2017 as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- sharing views and best practice challenges amongst participants (bottom-up)</li> <li>- taking place from 17 October, evening, until 19 October, lunchtime, at KU Leuven</li> <li>- planning for one or two full sessions and for a number of break-off groups</li> <li>- targeting an audience of 90 participants: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- 3 participants per member/ agency (45 persons)</li> <li>- extra attendants of agencies+ external (25 persons)</li> <li>- invited speakers and partner institution representatives (10 persons)</li> <li>- organizers + AC members (10 persons)</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	

**MINUTES OF THE 42<sup>nd</sup> ENAAEE  
ADMINISTRATIVE COUNCIL MEETING  
14 March 2017, 10.30-15.00 hrs  
ENAAEE premises, Brussels**

**42AC/265A**  
Status: 20 June 2017

A/D 19.	<p>It was <b>noted</b> that KUL offered the rooms free of charge. Regarding conference and dinner fees, it was <b>agreed</b> that expenses should remain in line with the approved 2017 budget for the “Members’ Forum” (EUR 5.000,-). The following draft budget was <b>noted</b>:</p> <p>Expenses:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- coffee breaks (estimated at EUR 3.500,-)</li> <li>- dinner (estimated at EUR 5.500,-)</li> <li>- welcome desk and registration (estimated at EUR 1.500,-)</li> <li>- travel costs for some 15 persons: speakers, guests, organizers (estimated at EUR 10.000,-)</li> </ul> <p>Income:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- registration fee of EUR 150,-/participant (except for invited speakers, partner institution representatives, organizers and AC members)</li> <li>- dinner fee of about EUR 50,-/participant (taken over by ENAAEE for the above mentioned groups)</li> </ul> <p><b>10.1.4 Report about the pending and upcoming authorizations (ZSVTS, KazSEE) and re-authorizations (ARACIS, QUACING)</b></p> <p>The LC Chair reported that ARACIS and QUACING were informed about the expiry of their authorizations by 31/12/2017. Both agencies indicated their interest to renew their authorizations. The new re-authorization Template, approved by the AC today, will be sent to them and formal applications asked by early May such that the LC can set up respective ERTs at its meeting on 19 May.</p> <p>It was <b>noted</b> that the time limit to KazSEE for providing evidence of its admission into the Kazakh “Register of Accreditation Agencies (as part of its authorized agency application) has been set at 31/12/2017. Prof. A. SQUARZONI referred to article 3.3.2 of the EAFSG and <b>noted</b> that the requirement for a legal status is not a mandatory condition of the EAFSG but has been decided by the LC for the application from KazSEE. It was <b>noted</b> that ENAAEE also received an expression of interest about ENAAEE membership from the Independent Kazakh Agency for Quality Assurance in Education (IQAA). The PRESIDENT had answered by inviting them to coordinate with KazSEE.</p> <p>It was <b>noted</b> that a report from the ERT and possible LC recommendation on the agency application of ZSVTS will be on the agenda of the next LC meeting on 19 May 2017.</p> <p><b>10.1.5 Appointment of the LC members from ARACIS and OE</b> <b>256</b></p> <p>The second mandates as LC member expired for Prof. I. MANOLIU (ARACIS) and S. TELES (OE). Both were re-nominated by their respective agencies for one more year, until 31/12/2017, in line with Article B8(B) of the ENAAEE Bylaws. This gives the possibility of extending the mandate (beyond the normal period of three years renewable once) for preserving continuity in LC membership, The AC <b>agreed</b> to extend the appointments of Prof. I. MANOLIU and Mrs. S. TELES accordingly, until 31/12/2017.</p>	<b>By</b> President, WG
20.	<p>The second mandates as LC member expired for Prof. I. MANOLIU (ARACIS) and S. TELES (OE). Both were re-nominated by their respective agencies for one more year, until 31/12/2017, in line with Article B8(B) of the ENAAEE Bylaws. This gives the possibility of extending the mandate (beyond the normal period of three years renewable once) for preserving continuity in LC membership, The AC <b>agreed</b> to extend the appointments of Prof. I. MANOLIU and Mrs. S. TELES accordingly, until 31/12/2017.</p>	President, Secretariat

**MINUTES OF THE 42<sup>nd</sup> ENAAEE  
ADMINISTRATIVE COUNCIL MEETING  
14 March 2017, 10.30-15.00 hrs  
ENAAEE premises, Brussels**

A/D	Running Projects and WG Reports	By
	<p><b>10.2 Running Projects and WG Reports</b></p> <p><b>10.2.1 To receive a report from the WG on an ENAAEE e-book 257</b></p> <p>It was <b>noted</b> that Dr. E. PAYZIN will act as editor-in-chief of the ENAAEE Task Force on the ENAAEE e-book. The editorial group further comprises Messrs. G. AUGUSTI, P. COMPTE, G. HEITMAN and I. FREESTON who resigned as chief editor due to health problems. It was <b>noted</b> that contributions will be collected from AC members Messrs. D. BOCHAR (on FEANI) and D. McGRATH (on the EUR-ACE database). It was <b>noted</b> that the publication of the e-book had been envisaged for June but might be delayed.</p> <p><b>10.3 Promotional matters</b></p> <p>The agenda topic was covered in the above agenda items.</p> <p><b>11. Any Other Business</b></p> <p><b>11.1 Appoint of the ENAAEE Vice-President(s) (VPs) 258</b></p> <p>Article S18 of the ENAAEE Statutes stipulates that <i>“to support the activities of the President, except in legal affairs, the AC may appoint, upon proposal by the President, up to two of its Members as Vice-Presidents. They keep this title as long as their mandate as AC member or the mandate of the President, whichever ends first”</i>. PRESIDENT felt that the provisions were not clear for the present case, where both the mandates of himself as President and of the two AC members appointed by the AC as VPs during the PRESIDENT’s first mandate (Messrs. D. BOCHAR and D. McGRATH) were renewed by the GA on 22 November 2016. It was <b>agreed</b> that the next revision of the Statutes should include a clarification whether a new proposal for appointment of VPs needs be made by the President in such cases. The PRESIDENT proposed that Messrs. D. BOCHAR and D. McGRATH continue being ENAAEE VPs.</p> <p>Mr. D. BOCHAR proposed to select a person as VP who might ensure the President’s succession when his term expires on 31/12/2018. The PRESIDENT responded that probably several vacancies would arise at the GA in November 2017. At 31/12/2017, Prof. C. BORRI will finish his second and thus last term and Messrs. R. APPEL, M. BRIDGEFOOT and A.M. JOLLY will finish their first terms and are eligible for a second term. The PRESIDENT proposed to review the appointment of VPs with the new AC team after the GA elections in November and to then to consider and prepare succession. This was <b>agreed</b>.</p> <p>The AC <b>appointed</b> Messrs. D. BOCHAR and D. McGRATH as ENAAEE Vice-Presidents.</p>	<p>By</p> <p>President, AC</p> <p>President</p> <p>Bochar, McGrath</p>
21.		
22.		
23.		

