

**MINUTES OF THE 38th ENAAEE
ADMINISTRATIVE COUNCIL MEETING
17 November 2015, 09:30-12:30 hrs
Cercle de Lorraine, Brussels**

38AC/203
Status: 8 March 2016

A/D	Present:	By
	<p><u>Chair:</u> Prof. Bernard REMAUD – President</p> <p><u>Members:</u> Mr. Ralph APPEL (as from item 6.2) Mr. Dirk BOCHAR Prof. Claudio BORRI Mr. Mike BRIDGEFOOT Ms. Françoise COME (as from item 6.1) Mr. Denis MCGRATH Mr. Juhani NOKELA Prof. Alfredo SQUARZONI</p> <p><u>Guests:</u> Mr. Jean-Claude ARDITTI, Label Committee (LC) Chair</p> <p><u>Secretary:</u> Ms. Rita HEISSNER</p>	
	<p>1. Opening and Welcome</p> <p>The President opened the meeting and welcomed the participants.</p>	
	<p>2. Apologies for Absence</p> <p>No apologies were received. Mr. C. BORRI explained that he had not been able to attend the two previous AC meetings, in particular due to his involvement in ENAAEE activities, including the QUEECA project with the objective to generate new ENAAEE membership. This was noted.</p>	
	<p>3. Approval of the Draft Agenda 197A</p> <p>The draft agenda was approved.</p>	
	<p>4. Approval of the Minutes of the Past Meeting 195</p> <p>The Minutes from the past meeting on 23 June 2015 were approved without modifications.</p>	
1.	<p>5. Review of the A/D List 196A</p> <p><i>Item 27 of the 34th meeting/policy on EU project involvement:</i> the PRESIDENT reminded that ENAAEE is not eligible to receive funds from “staff costs” in EU Projects as ENAAEE does not have employees. Its role within EU Projects can be to provide expertise, seminars, etc. On the other hand, ENAAEE members could take over activities</p>	AC

**MINUTES OF THE 38th ENAAEE
ADMINISTRATIVE COUNCIL MEETING
17 November 2015, 09:30-12:30 hrs
Cercle de Lorraine, Brussels**

38AC/203
Status: 8 March 2016

A/D		By
	<p>and claim “staff costs”. Mr. C. BORRI amplified that in addition to ENAAEE itself, ENAAEE members (agencies) should take part in the EU projects. Within ERASMUS projects, ENAAEE could then receive funding for organizational services. Mr. J.-C. ARDITTI cautioned that “subcontracting” from an agency to ENAAEE is only possible if ENAAEE is not a project partner itself. This was noted.</p> <p><i>Item 4 of the 36th meeting/Annual Report publication:</i> this will be considered for the next year with the finalization of the EUR-ACE database upgrade.</p> <p><i>Item 6 of the 36th meeting/list of “deliberations”:</i> this is part of the current website amelioration.</p> <p><i>Item 19 of the 36th meeting/member survey:</i> this is planned for 2016 and will include also a comprehensive review of website information.</p> <p><i>Item 23 of the 36th meeting/ABET interest in awarding the EUR-ACE label:</i> at the occasion of the IEA meetings in Istanbul in June 2015, ABET was asked to formalize its request. Such a letter has not yet been received. It was generally considered that the matter is related to “Transnational Accreditation”, currently under review by the LC for a recommendation to the AC. The Vice-President, Mr. D. McGRATH, considered that ENAAEE should then further pursuit with ABET as this could generate both income and promotion for ENAAEE.</p> <p>It was noted that all other actions were in process or covered by respective agenda items.</p> <p>6. Financial Matters 6.1 Financial Results as at 31/08/2015, Forecast and Invoicing Plan GA/81</p> <p>The VP, Mr. D. BOCHAR, introduced the financial results as at 31 August 2015 which were overall in line with the Budget.</p> <p>Income: All ENAAEE members and agencies, as well as associate members, have paid their fee for 2015, with the exception of IFEES. With regard to the EUR-ACE labels it is expected to do better than budgeted.</p> <p>Expenses: A provision for a possible return payment of some EUR 20.000,- to the EU Commission, in case of non-justified funding from the past relating to the EUR-ACE SPREAD project was taken. As a result of this provision the fiscal year 2015 may close with a loss of some EUR 5.000,-.</p> <p>Mr. C. BORRI reported that in July the external audit company charged by the EU Commission has finalized its examination related to a number of EU-funded projects led by UNIFI as grantholder. He stated that the audit company had also included in their checking some requirements such as copies of employee bank extracts that are recommended by the EU Commission but that are not mandatory. There has been no official information from the EU Commission on the audit result yet.</p>	

**MINUTES OF THE 38th ENAAEE
ADMINISTRATIVE COUNCIL MEETING**

38AC/203
Status: 8 March 2016

**17 November 2015, 09:30-12:30 hrs
Cercle de Lorraine, Brussels**

A/D		By
	<p>Ms. F. COME explained that IFEES' Board of Directors had never taken an official decision to become member of ENAAEE and therefore will not settle any fees for 2015. In view of future potential IFEES membership, she recommended they should not be shown as "bad debtors". Mr. D. BOCHAR responded that "Bad Debtors" is the international term used in the International Accountant Standards (IAS). Mr. C. BORRI felt that both organizations should show their commitment through reciprocal membership.</p> <p>The PRESIDENT suggested that ENAAEE should examine its policy with regard to year-end surpluses and reflect on whether investing year-end surpluses into projects or into own personnel in the future. The Vice-President, Mr. D. BOCHAR, stated that legally there is no problem for ENAAEE as an international non-profit association to accumulate profits.</p> <p>The PRESIDENT highlighted that starting with the establishment of the Internal Procedures, responsibilities for projects and activities were assigned to specific AC members, in line with assigned budgets. The reports from the respective Project Managers are reported in item 9.2 ("Running projects/WG reports"). The Vice-President, Mr. D. BOCHAR, hoped that the up-front use and approval of travel request and cost reimbursement forms will lead to more transparency in costs. The report and comments were noted.</p> <p>6.2 Budget 2016 GA/81</p> <p>The AC reviewed the 2016 Budget proposal set up by the TREASURER and the Vice-President, Mr. D. BOCHAR. The income included KazSEE and ZSVTS as new members as well as ANECA, FINEEC and KAUT that already pay an Authorized Agency fee. The Budget assumed a small decrease of EUR-ACE labels, based on the estimation from the LC. As for projects, QUEECA will end in April 2016 and the new CALOHEE project will have only little impact. As for expenses, provisions were made under "Depreciations" for further IT developments to the EUR-ACE database. Assumed is an investment of EUR 20.000,- to be depreciated over the next three years. The FEANI Service Contract was budgeted with an increase of EUR 5.000, subject to an update of the costs of the services, including the workload of the Secretariat.</p> <p>Mr. D. BOCHAR, as the FEANI Secretary General, noted that the amount currently allocated for the Secretary's work did not by far meet the actual amount of work performed. He further explained that initially, the various ledgers of the FEANI budget had served as the basis for calculating a percentage for the service contract with ENAAEE.</p> <p>The PRESIDENT pointed to his proposal for "Definition of activities and assignments" for 2016. This sets out in particular the following main activities/projects for which responsibilities should be finalized after election of the new AC:</p>	

**MINUTES OF THE 38th ENAAE
ADMINISTRATIVE COUNCIL MEETING
17 November 2015, 09:30-12:30 hrs
Cercle de Lorraine, Brussels**

38AC/203
Status: 8 March 2016

A/D		By
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Management (SC; EU Institutions; QA; Events incl. Members' Forum) - Joint database of engineering programmes FEANI-ENAAE - Promotion (website; communication material) - Working Groups (IEA-ENAAE; EAFSG; Transnational Accreditation) - European and other projects (QUEECA; CALOHEE; CTF) - ENAAE Strengthening (members; applicants; partners) - ENAAE Spreading - Revision of the website to ensure it responds to both members' and public needs 	
2.	<p>The Vice-President, Mr. D. McGRATH, felt that ENAAE should support a conference organized by ASIIN from 2-4 May 2016 in Berlin on the subject of "The Mystery of the Untapped Potential of HE Quality Assurance and Accreditation - How we can tackle the five remaining grand challenges". It was agreed that ENAAE will organize an ENAAE session and sponsor the event with some EUR 2.800,-. Mr. McGRATH otherwise felt that he should have been consulted as project manager in charge of "promotion" at the time when the Budget 2016 was set up. The Vice-President, Mr. D. BOCHAR responded that the Budget has been set up in line with the previous year's Budget and Forecast for both income and expenses. Given the nature and size of ENAAE's Budget and activities, it was not considered appropriate to ask all "managers" for their travel aspirations.</p>	President
3.	<p>The PRESIDENT concluded that in line with the new approved Internal Procedures, starting with the Budget 2017 preparation, the TREASURER and SECRETARIAT will consult major project managers in June and then consolidate the Budget by setting priorities. This was agreed.</p>	Treasurer, Bochar
4.	<p>The AC agreed to approve the Budget 2016 as presented. This includes provisions for the following items:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - "FEANI Contract": this is subject to a reconsideration in 2016 for which a mandate is given to the President, reflecting the workload of the FEANI Secretariat as well as "indirect costs" (office costs related to the Secretariat's tasks) - FEANI-ENAAE database merge" (depreciations): this is subject to a further review of the project, based upon an analysis and recommendation from Mr. M. BRIDGEFOOT, assigned as project manager. 	President, Bochar, Bridgefoot
	<p>7. Network Matters</p> <p>7.1 Recommendations to GA on ENAAE Membership Applications</p> <p>7.1.1 ZSVTS (SK) GA/72</p>	
5.	<p>The AC reviewed the application as Full Member from the Association of Slovak Scientific and Technological Societies (ZSVTS). It agreed to recommend to the General Assembly in the afternoon ZSVTS as new Full Member as of 1 January 2016.</p>	President

**MINUTES OF THE 38th ENAAEE
ADMINISTRATIVE COUNCIL MEETING
17 November 2015, 09:30-12:30 hrs
Cercle de Lorraine, Brussels**

38AC/203
Status: 8 March 2016

A/D		By
	<p>7.1.2, INGITE (ES), COGITI (ES) 7.1.3 GA/74, GA/75</p> <p>The AC reviewed the applications as Full Members from the Instituto de Graduados en Ingenieria e Ingenieros Tecnicos de España (INGITE) as well as from the Consejo General de la Ingenieria Técnica Industrial (COGITI). INGITE (formerly INITE) had initiated its application in 2014 and then followed up in June 2015. They stated that they had taken contact with the Spanish ENAAEE member IIE and the Spanish Authorized Agency ANECA, as recommended by the ENAAEE PRESIDENT in response to their initial application. COGITI had sent an application in August 2015. The PRESIDENT considered that in case of several membership applications from one country, those should be coordinated nationally, for instance through setting up a National ENAAEE Committee, following the example of FEANI. The Vice-President, Mr. D. McGRATH, felt that associations such as INGITE should join with other associations such as IIE but not necessarily with an Accreditation Agency such as ANECA. This was supported by Mr. J. NOKELA, pointing to the case of TEK (association) and FINEEC (accreditation agency) in Finland. Mr. C. BORRI considered that the case of the Italian members in ENAAEE was different as those would not be in competition.</p>	
6.	<p>The AC agreed to the following recommendation to the GA in the afternoon: both INGITE and COGITI would fulfil ENAAEE criteria for membership but their membership should be subject to the creation of a joint Committee.</p> <p>7.1.4 FINEEC (FI) GA/76A</p> <p>The AC reviewed the application as Full Member from the Finnish Education Evaluation Centre (FINEEC). FINEEC became Authorized Agency to award the EUR-ACE label (Bachelor level) in June 2014. The AC agreed to recommend to the General Assembly in the afternoon FINEEC as new Full Member as of 1 January 2016.</p>	President
7.	<p>7.1.5 ANECA (ES) GA/77A</p> <p>The AC reviewed the application as Full Member from the National Agency for Quality Assessment and Accreditation of Spain (ANECA). ANECA became Authorized Agency to award the EUR-ACE label (Bachelor and Master level) in June 2014. The AC agreed to recommend to the General Assembly in the afternoon ANECA as new Full Member as of 1 January 2016.</p>	President
8.	<p>7.1.6 Automatic Eligibility of Authorized Agencies as ENAAEE Members GA/78</p> <p>Under the present rules, agencies authorized by ENAAEE to award the EUR-ACE label are not automatically eligible for membership. The ENAAEE Standing Committee (SC) had considered that this would no longer be appropriate. On the contrary, all Authorized</p>	President

**MINUTES OF THE 38th ENAAEE
ADMINISTRATIVE COUNCIL MEETING**

38AC/203
Status: 8 March 2016

17 November 2015, 09:30-12:30 hrs

Cercle de Lorraine, Brussels

A/D 9.	Agencies should be involved in the decision making of the network. The AC agreed to the following recommendation to the General Assembly in the afternoon: future Authorized Agency applications (to be approved by the AC) are coupled with an ENAAEE membership application (to be recommended by the AC for approval by the GA). The annual membership fee would waive the agency fee, i.e. no double fee is due. Mr. D. BOCHAR stated that an assessment of the financial capabilities of new members should be considered an important part of the membership application examination. This was agreed .	By President
10.		President
	<p>7.2 Status of Participation in Projects: QUEECA; CALOHEE 186</p>	
	<p>Mr. C. BORRI gave a verbal report from the past meeting of the World Engineering Education Forum (WEEF), 20-24 September 2015, hosted by UNIFI in Florence. This had included an ENAAEE session as well as a QUEECA project meeting. He highlighted the good quality of participants and speakers and in particular the participation of Central Asian countries. This had also allowed for a number of side events such as the signing of the “Florence Charter of Cooperation” between Rectors from Kazakh and Italian universities. The PRESIDENT praised the opportunity of networking, for instance with Latin and Central American participants and other organizations such as IFEEES that showed interest in the “European model”. The report was noted.</p>	
	<p>8. Strategic and Policy Matters</p>	
	<p>8.1 Relationship between FEANI and ENAAEE 198</p>	
	<p>The PRESIDENT introduced his circulated report on the relationship between FEANI and ENAAEE. He noted the important role of FEANI as a founding member of ENAAEE and as a provider of a range of secretariat services to ENAAEE, based upon an “Agreement”, first signed in 2012. He emphasized ENAAEE’s aspiration for autonomy and independence which should be expected from a European organization with Quality Assurance responsibilities and accountability. This had materialized recently in the move to a new web server, independent from the FEANI one. This framework would allow for appropriate concentration on common projects. The PRESIDENT recommended that the ENAAEE-FEANI cooperation should continue in 2016, however with a somewhat better coordination to avoid possible misunderstandings and conflicting opinions. In the longer term, ENAAEE might want to reflect on the sustainability of its present management model, in line with ENAAEE’s capacities. He proposed a joint FEANI and ENAAEE Board meeting (or of representatives of the two Boards) to coordinate mid-term and long-range objectives and activities.</p>	
	<p>Mr. A. SQUARZONI uttered support for ENAAEE’s strive for autonomy and visibility. He concurred with the project of a common database with FEANI but stressed that ENAAEE needed to have a separate database listing only the EUR-ACE labels. He</p>	

**MINUTES OF THE 38th ENAAEE
ADMINISTRATIVE COUNCIL MEETING**

38AC/203
Status: 8 March 2016

17 November 2015, 09:30-12:30 hrs

Cercle de Lorraine, Brussels

A/D		By
	<p>considered that ENAAEE's main stakeholders were from academia while FEANI's stakeholders were mainly from the profession. Mr. R. APPEL stated that both organizations should work together more closely, ensuring its own separate roles. A joint database would be a big asset for all stakeholders which he considered to be the same for the two associations. Messages to the "outside world" should be unified rather than fragmented. He supported the idea of regular exchanges in view of future alignment and cooperation. Mr. C. BORRI disagreed that the two databases are designed for the same users. He saw as stakeholders of the ENAAEE database the educational system (universities, ministries and policy makers in education) rather than the individual engineer who would be more targeted by the FEANI INDEX.</p> <p>The Vice-President, Mr. D. McGRATH, further stressed that if ENAAEE and FEANI databases come together, ENAAEE needs to keep its separate database on its website. He advocated an intensified cooperation of ENAAEE, FEANI and SEFI, similar to the International Engineering Alliance (IEA).</p> <p>The Vice-President, Mr. D. BOCHAR, felt that recent irritation could have been avoided if the AC had considered the IT feasibility study already at the ENAAEE AC meeting in March, for which it was circulated. He advocated that FEANI and ENAAEE should concentrate work on the CTF and on joining databases. He noted that cooperation between the major engineering associations had already been initiated through a joint organization of the "2nd European Engineering Day" in November 2014.</p> <p>Mr. M. BRIDGEFOOT supported that a meeting of the Presidents of both FEANI and ENAAEE takes place in 2016.</p> <p>The AC supported the recommendations from the PRESIDENT which are also reflected in the discussions and agreement on the 2016 Budget.</p> <p>9. Reports on Projects, Committees and Activities</p> <p>9.1 Label Committee (LC) Issues</p> <p>199</p> <p>A number of vacancies in the LC arise as of 1 January 2016. The following persons were (re)nominated by the respective Authorized Agencies:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - AEER: Prof. S. GERASIMOV, renomination for a second 3-years term - ASIIN: Mr. G. HEITMANN, renomination for one more year, and then to be replaced by Prof. H.-J. BARGSTAEDT as of 1 January 2017, for 2 years - CTI: Mr. J.-C. ARDITTI, renomination for one more year, and then to be replaced by Ms. E. LAVIGNE, for 2 years - IIE: Prof. C. BURKLEY, renomination for a second 3-years term - MUDEK: Prof. T. DOGU, renomination for a second 3-years term - QUACING: Prof. G. AUGUSTI, renomination for a second 3-years term - ANECA and FINEEC: awaiting agency nomination 	

MINUTES OF THE 38th ENAE
ADMINISTRATIVE COUNCIL MEETING
17 November 2015, 09:30-12:30 hrs
Cercle de Lorraine, Brussels

38AC/203
Status: 8 March 2016

A/D		By
11.	The LC at its meeting on 20 October 2015 had reviewed the nominations and supports them. The AC agreed to appoint all above LC members accordingly. The appointment of Prof. M. BARGSTAEDT is subject to receiving his CV from ASIIN and subsequent positive LC recommendation.	President
12. 13.	The AC approved the extensions of authorization for EngC until 31/12/2018 and for QUACING until 31/12/2016. It also approved the new authorization of KazSEE (Bachelor and Master level) subject to a number of conditions. The detailed LC recommendations are in Annex I of the Minutes.	President President, LC Chair
	9.2 Running Projects/WG Reports 200A	
	The VP, Mr. D. McGRATH, reported that the EUR-ACE database upgrade into DRUPAL has been implemented and is now live on the website. The new system allows for more statistical analysis and search possibilities.	
14.	The LC Chair, Mr. J.-C. ARDITTI, reported about the work-in-progress of the Working Group on “Transnational Accreditation Policy”. The Vice-President, Mr. D. McGRATH, considered that agencies should only be authorized by unanimous vote, also in view of the Mutual Recognition Agreement that is signed by all Authorized Agencies. This would also be the practice in the Washington Accord. It was agreed that by end of the year, AC members should send to the LC Chair any comments on the draft text included in document 199. The WG will then finalize a recommendation to the AC for its meeting in spring 2016.	All AC members, LC Chair
	As for the status of the WG with the IEA, it was noted that this has recently been resumed.	
	On the EAFSG WG, the PRESIDENT informed that this should be resumed after the new AC elections. He himself would not be available to chair this WG, due to time constraints.	
	Mr. M. BRIDGEFOOT introduced an overview project plan, considering the objectives, responsibilities, constraints, approach and stages of the FEANI INDEX and EUR-ACE database “unification”. He noted that he was in the process of collecting advice and comments from stakeholders, including users and IT experts. From a first review, he considered that such a unification under the present premises would represent a matter of principle. It would represent a major long-term investment to be spread over a number of years that would not result in additional income for ENAE. Some time-saving for members were expected.	
15.	It was agreed that Mr. M. BRIDGEFOOT will continue gather information on estimated costs, alternative scenarios including pros and cons and benefits. He will make a consolidated report to the next AC meeting in order to prepare the basis for an AC decision.	Bridgefoot

