

**MINUTES OF THE 36th ENAAEE
ADMINISTRATIVE COUNCIL MEETING
31 March 2015, 10:30-16:30 hrs
FEANI/ENAAEE premises, Brussels**

36AC/179
Status: 23 June 2015

A/D	Present:	By
	<p><u>Chair:</u> Prof. Bernard REMAUD – President</p> <p><u>Members:</u> Mr. Ralph APPEL (except for items 6 and 8-12) Mr. Dirk BOCHAR Mr. Denis MCGRATH Mr. Juhani NOKELA Prof. Alfredo SQUARZONI</p> <p><u>Guests:</u> Mr. Jean-Claude ARDITTI, Label Committee Chair</p> <p><u>Secretary:</u> Mrs. Rita HEISSNER</p>	
	<p>1. Opening and Welcome</p> <p>The President opened the meeting and welcomed the participants.</p>	
1.	<p>2. Apologies for Absence</p> <p>Apologies were noted from Messrs. C. BORRI, M. BRIDGEFOOT and Ms. F. COME. Mr. C. BORRI had given proxy for votings to Mr. A. SQUARZONI, Mrs. F. COME to Mr. D. BOCHAR. It was agreed on a general basis not to accept meeting “observers” other than the actual AC members, even for AC members who cannot attend a meeting.</p>	AC
2.	<p>2.1 AC Resignation from Dr. R. FERNANDEZ ALLER</p> <p>By letter dated 11 February 2015, ENAAEE received the resignation of Dr. R. ALLER as ENAAEE AC member with immediate effect. His term started on 01/04/2014 and finishes on 31/12/2017. In line with the ENAAEE Statutes, the GA in November 2015 will be asked to elect a new member for the remainder of Mr. R. ALLER’s term. This was noted. The AC thanked Mr. R. ALLER for his commitment in his work for ENAAEE.</p>	President, Secretariat
	<p>3. Approval of the Draft Agenda 167A</p> <p>The tabled report from the Internal Auditor, Mr. E. PAYZIN, relating to the 2014 Financial Results, was noted. The draft agenda was approved with a change in the order of agenda items. The topic “finances” (agenda items 6.1-6.2) will be considered at the end of the meeting, in the light of agreements taken before.</p>	
3.	<p>4. Approval of the Minutes of the Past Meeting 165</p> <p>The Minutes of the AC meeting on 19 November 2014 were approved without modifications.</p>	AC

**MINUTES OF THE 36th ENAAEE
ADMINISTRATIVE COUNCIL MEETING
31 March 2015, 10:30-16:30 hrs
FEANI/ENAAEE premises, Brussels**

36AC/179
Status: 23 June 2015

A/D	5. Review of the A/D List 166A	By
4.	<p>The open items were noted to be covered by the agenda, except for the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A/D 14 of the 35th meeting: It was agreed that the publication of an Annual Report is postponed, subject to the upgrade of the EUR-ACE database, which should allow for a meaningful analysis of the awarded labels. 	McGrath
5.	<p>6. Financial Matters 6.1 Financial Results 2014 168</p> <p>The AC noted the financial results at 31/12/2014 as prepared by the accountant. This shows a surplus of EUR 10.442,16 at year-end. The TREASURER reported that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - the income from EUR-ACE label awards was EUR 15.200,- higher than budgeted - the “travel and living” costs substantially exceeded the budget and represent 26% of total turnover. It was noted that those included travels for LC members (now 13 authorized agencies), promotional travel/conferences of Standing Committee members, as well as of the EAFSG WG. This happened in line with the President’s Strategic Plan, confirmed by the GA in November 2014. Vice President D. BOCHAR had proposed that it would be good business practice if Travel Request Forms could be filled out and approved by the President, prior to the actual reimbursement of expenses. This was agreed by the President. 	President, Bochar
6.	<p>The AC unanimously approved the financial results 2014 for presentation to the GA on 17 November 2015. It was agreed to recommend to the GA to put the surplus of the year into the Reserves. The AC furthermore agreed to look on the medium term into the possibility of obtaining more interest on the Reserves. This would need to be in a save way/considering the network’s legal status as a not-for profit association.</p>	AC, Secretariat Treasurer
7.		
8.	<p>6.2 Review of approved Budget 2015 and related activities 169</p> <p>The budget 2015 had been approved by the GA on 19 November 2014. It was agreed that the TREASURER and the VP Mr. D. BOCHAR will make a forecast in May for consideration at the AC meeting on 23 June. This should include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - an extra provision of some EUR 7.000,- (under “Depreciation”) for the EUR-ACE database upgrade from EUR 5.307,- to EUR 12.000,- (ref. decision reported under agenda item 9.1). - the reduction by half of the budget for items “promotion events” (from EUR 12.500,- to EUR 6.000,-) and “ENAAEE Conference” (from EUR 10.000,- to EUR 5.000,-) - the takeover of the registration fee and travel for ENAAEE representatives for conducting a specific workshop on accreditation at the SEFI Annual Conference in 	Treasurer, Bochar

**MINUTES OF THE 36th ENAAEE
ADMINISTRATIVE COUNCIL MEETING
31 March 2015, 10:30-16:30 hrs
FEANI/ENAAEE premises, Brussels**

36AC/179
Status: 23 June 2015

A/D		By
	<p>Orleans in June and for the ENAAEE workshop at the WEEF2015 conference in November. This will be added under the budget item “ENAAEE Conference.</p> <p>- a provision of EUR 20.000,- under “Bad Debts” for a possible reclaim by the EU Commission related to staff costs for the EUR-ACE SPREAD project (2008-2010). The grantholder of the project, UNIFI, is currently undergoing an ex-post audit by an external audit company charged by the EU Commission.</p> <p>7. Network Matters</p> <p>7.1 Approval of Best Practice document with the IEA 170</p> <p>The AC noted the document “Best Practice for Engineering Accreditation” that had been drafted by the WG led by the ENAAEE President and the Washington Accord Chair Mr. H. HANRAHAN. The document was set up as a guideline for a common general understanding of best practice principles and procedures. The draft had been circulated also among ENAAEE AC and LC members as well as IEA Accord members to collect comments. Those comments still need to be implemented in the final document but will only consist in fine-tuning which does not affect the basis of the document. Requests by ENAAEE members to include requirements regarding students’ implications and publication of review reports could however not be considered for this general document as they are not regular practices all over the world.</p>	
9.	The AC unanimously approved the proposed “Best Practice” document draft. It agreed that the WG will prepare the final version incorporating the detailed corrections from ENAAEE/IEA members. The final version will be presented for approval/signature at a joint IEA/ENAAEE forum in Istanbul on 23 June 2015. It was agreed that the document	President
10.	will be a powerful marketing tool. Once approved, the AC will decide on its publication/launch, for instance in the framework of the ENAAEE GA in November. Mr.	AC
11.	D. BOCHAR also proposed to foresee that this document and also the EASFG would be converted into a .ppt presentation for future promotional purposes. This was agreed .	President, McGrath, Secretariat
	<p>7.2 Project Submissions where ENAAEE agrees to become a Partner</p> <p>7.2.1 Approval of ENAAEE’s possible participation in NAME and CALOHEE 171</p> <p>The President reported that he had been solicited to confirm ENAAEE’s participation as Partner in three EU project proposals.</p> <p>1. “European Platform for Youth Involvement”, proposed by BEST: rejected by the EU Commission in the first round but was currently reconsidered in a second round.</p> <p>2. “NAME” (North Africa and Mediterranean Engineering – Education and Profession) concerning Algeria, Libya, Morocco and Tunisia, proposed by UNIFI. The role of ENAAEE would in essence consist in organising seminars on QA etc. for the definition of standards. Any on-site accreditations would be conducted by agencies involved in the project, in particular QUACING and CTI.</p>	

**MINUTES OF THE 36th ENAAEE
ADMINISTRATIVE COUNCIL MEETING
31 March 2015, 10:30-16:30 hrs
FEANI/ENAAEE premises, Brussels**

36AC/179
Status: 23 June 2015

A/D		By
	<p>3. "CALOHEE" (Measuring and Comparing Achievements of Learning Outcomes in Higher Education), proposed by TUNING Europe/University of Groningen and the Educational Testing Service (ETS).</p>	
12.	<p>The AC noted ENAAEE's participation as Partner in the EU project proposals NAME and CALOHEE. The PRESIDENT considered that participation in such projects is in the core of ENAAEE's mission. The VP Mr. D. BOCHAR stated that ENAAEE needs to set out more precise internal rules prior to decide to engage in EU projects. It must be clear in advance what the timeframe, the conditions and ENAAEE tasks in EU-funded projects would be before agreeing to become a project partner. Current engagements in EU projects resulted in excessive administrative support by the ENAAEE secretariat with hardly any significant revenues resulting from it. ENAAEE could be involved as Associate Partner, for instance with regard to dissemination of project results. This would ensure some visibility but be less work intensive. ENAAEE could also approach the EU Commission to issue a Tender for a specific subject in case there is a specific project idea. The above general lines were noted.</p>	President, AC
13.	<p>7.3 Schedule and Topics for the 2015 WEEF/ENAAEE sessions and the status of setting up a MoU 172</p> <p>The AC noted the revised draft agenda for the ENAAEE plenary session in the morning of Thursday, 24 September 2015 in the framework of the WEEF in Florence. Regarding a possible ENAAEE workshop in the afternoon of 24 September, it was decided to cancel it, also given that all other afternoon workshops were removed and interest/participation was thus expected to be limited. This was agreed. It was noted that some of the travel costs to Florence for ENAAEE representatives will be covered by QUEECA as a project meeting will be held at the same time. Any conference registration fees as well as costs for speakers will be covered by ENAAEE's budget item "ENAAEE Conference".</p>	AC
14.	<p>7.4 Reports about ENAAEE membership applications</p> <p>7.4.1 AAQ (status of circular resolution)</p> <p>By e-mail of 5 February 2015, all 16 ENAAEE GA members received their voting ballot regarding the admission as Full Member of AAQ (Organ fuer Akkreditierung und Qualitaetssicherung der schweizerischen Hochschulen), previously called OAQ. AAQ is an authorized agency since June 2014. Deadline for returning the ballots is 10 April 2015. This was noted.</p> <p>7.4.2 Other contacts established</p> <p>Mr. D. McGRATH reported about his meetings with the FEANI National Members from SE and SK. SE would at the current stage be more interested on a general level regarding a programme accreditation approach. SK is expected to apply as authorized agency in</p>	President, AC

**MINUTES OF THE 36th ENAAEE
ADMINISTRATIVE COUNCIL MEETING
31 March 2015, 10:30-16:30 hrs
FEANI/ENAAEE premises, Brussels**

36AC/179
Status: 23 June 2015

A/D	<p>September. The PRESIDENT reported about his meeting with the FEANI National Member from CZ. CZ is also considering/preparing for applying as authorized agency, possibly next year. Further contacts/meetings concerned Tunisia (Mr. D. McGRATH), Lebanon (Mr. G. AUGUSTI) and in due course Ukraine (PRESIDENT and VP Mr. D. BOCHAR).</p> <p>8. Strategic and Policy Matters</p> <p>8.1 Report about a meeting with the EU Commission/Mr. M. FROHN 173</p> <p>The PRESIDENT and the two VPs Messrs. D. BOCHAR and D. McGRATH had met with Mr. M. FROHN, Head of Unit “Free Movement of Professionals” at the DG for Internal Market, Industry, Entrepreneurship and SMEs on 19 December 2014. Mr. M. FROHN expressed the Commission’s interest in the engineering profession for a new tool introduced in Article 49a of the EU Directive 2013/55/EU, namely the Common Training Framework (CTF). The CTF represents a “common set of minimum knowledge, skills and competences necessary for the pursuit of a specific profession”.</p> <p>8.2 Presentation by Mr. M. FROHN on the subject of CTFs</p> <p>Mr. M. FROHN presented the political context, background, characteristics/conditions and effects of the CTF concept as an initiative for automatic recognition. It should offer the possibility to facilitate mobility for a number of important professions. He gave an outlook of the next steps for the CTF approach: formulate a “concept note” by summer how the CTF should look like, then work in a Focus Group on a CTF in 2016 for adoption in 2017. For this, the Commission is looking to work with a limited number of professions, favouring an inclusive step by step approach without priority to specific organisations. It was considered that civil engineering could be a first group interested in a CTF. The presentation is added to these Minutes as Annex I.</p> <p>The PRESIDENT felt that ENAAEE needed some more clarification on how far to go into details, EUR-ACE being a general framework for all engineers and not for specialities. Mr. D. BOCHAR stressed the importance to bring together the various engineering associations to speak with one voice of the profession. Mr. M. FROHN acknowledged the Quality Assurance aspect of the EUR-ACE system and the system’s adaptability as a general framework without affecting/regulating education that remains a prerequisite of the individual EU Member States.</p> <p>8.3 Proposal for the Revision of §2.2b of the EAFSG 174</p> <p>At its meeting on 19 November 2014, the AC had approved the EAFSG document, except for policy matters related to §2.2b. For this, a WG was set up, chaired by the ENAAEE President. All agencies represented in the WG have approved the present proposal: three without reservations, seven as a first step, subject to a further assessment of the ENAAEE labelling policy.</p>	By
------------	--	-----------

**MINUTES OF THE 36th ENAAEE
ADMINISTRATIVE COUNCIL MEETING
31 March 2015, 10:30-16:30 hrs
FEANI/ENAAEE premises, Brussels**

36AC/179
Status: 23 June 2015

A/D		By
15.	<p>Mr. A. SQUARZONI presented the main amendments to §2.2b:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - new introduction with more-fit description of contexts and references to the EHEA - reorganization/rewording subsections “engineering practice” and “making judgement” - new subsection on “student workload” - a compromise on required number of ECTS <p>The AC approved the revision of §2.2b of the EAFSG and subsequently the final overall EAFSG. Mr. D. McGRATH will finetune any English language issues and have the website designer implement the document as an e-document on the ENAAEE website.</p> <p>8.4 Review of the Results of the Policy on the EUR-ACE label awarding 175A</p> <p>8.4.1 Review of the policy on the EUR-ACE label awarding</p> <p>After eight years of programme labelling, the AC acknowledged the need for reviewing the results of the EUR-ACE label awarding policy regarding the consistency with its objectives and contexts. The following aspects were noted:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - ENAAEE objectives (“building a pan-European framework for the accreditation of engineering education programmes, in order to enhance the quality of engineering graduates, to facilitate the mobility of professional engineers and to promote quality and innovation in engineering education”) - compliance with EQF for lifelong learning - divergences regarding students’ workload requirements - EUR-ACE legitimacy in the global context (becoming a reference outside Europe) - building an internal consensus on “programme outcomes”: the first step is the agreement with the IEA on the procedures in the “Best Practice document”. As a next step towards a global framework for engineering education, a comparison of “programme learning outcomes” vs. “graduate attributes” should be done. <p>The following points were furthermore noted:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Some EUR-ACE labels are on the level covered by IEA’s Sydney Accord (for technologists), some by its Washington Accord. - The different policies of publication of review reports in the countries 	AC, McGrath
16.	<p>The AC approved the setting up of a Working Group to review the results of the EAFSG label policy with respect to the European diversity of education systems and its international legitimacy. The PRESIDENT will draft the Terms of Reference (ToR) for the WG. WG members will then be nominated.</p> <p>8.4.2 Review of the policy on transnational accreditation</p> <p>The review of ENAAEE’s policy on transnational accreditation was considered as a part of the longer-term preparation of a Charter of Good Conduct of the authorised agencies. Mr. J.C. ARDITTI considered important to collect information from authorized agencies on their handling, needs and recommendations regarding such a policy.</p>	President

**MINUTES OF THE 36th ENAAEE
ADMINISTRATIVE COUNCIL MEETING
31 March 2015, 10:30-16:30 hrs
FEANI/ENAAEE premises, Brussels**

36AC/179
Status: 23 June 2015

A/D 17.	<p>The AC approved the setting up of a Working Group to review the policy on transnational accreditation. The Label Committee will act as the WG. The PRESIDENT/SC will set the framework in ToR for the WG. The recommendations of the WG should be presented to the next AC meeting in June. This was agreed.</p>	By President Arditti
18.	<p>8.5 Review of EUR-ACE label submissions received between 01/01-30/05/2015 176</p> <p>The AC noted five new label submissions from CTI and two from OE for the EUR-ACE database. It was noted that the ones from OE will need some clarification before they can be introduced in the database. It was overall agreed that full information for the labels should be introduced by all agencies, including information on degree name and programme title in local and English language as well as on ECTS, semesters, programme type and accreditation duration.</p> <p>9. Committee Reports and Activities 9.1 Promotion Matters, incl. Eur-ACE database upgrade 177</p> <p>Mr. D. McGRATH introduced the offer from the IT provider NSI for an improvement of the EUR-ACE database. This was sought in order to solve existing bugs and allow for extended search/extract functions and more statistical information. Two approaches were proposed: keeping the existing version of TYPO3 (7.78 working days, EUR 5.447,- excl. VAT) or re-writing it in DRUPAL (12.5 working days, EUR 8.750,- excl. VAT).</p> <p>Mr. D. BOCHAR introduced the feasibility study that had been commanded by FEANI to the same IT provider just before the above offer. This concerned an integration of the FEANI INDEX and ENAAEE EUR-ACE label databases. It indicates that this can be done in DRUPAL, in 53 ¼ working days, at a total cost of EUR 36.742,50 (excl. VAT). It was suggested that the costs are shared 50/50 between FEANI and ENAAEE (depreciation over three years). It would also include the upgrade asked for by ENAAEE. Mr. D. BOCHAR informed that the FEANI Board at its meeting on 24 March had accepted the offer to merge the two databases. He highlighted the synergies between both systems serving the same objective. Mr. R. APPEL amplified the appropriateness and interest for users in having just one reference for engineering programmes.</p> <p>Mr. D. McGRATH felt that the ENAAEE database should be consolidated first. The PRESIDENT considered that it was necessary to reflect on the needs of both organisations and the users. It would be important to ensure responsibilities for and quality of the entries.</p>	Agencies, Secretariat
19. 20.	<p>The AC agreed to NCI's offer for upgrading of the ENAAEE database in DRUPAL. It was also agreed that the FEANI INDEX and the ENAAEE EUR-ACE label databases will be integrated once the EUR-ACE one is upgraded. A WG will be set up by the Secretariat with ENAAEE and FEANI representation to study the issues raised by the project (implementation, management and repartition of costs...).</p>	AC AC
21.		Secretariat

**MINUTES OF THE 36th ENAAEE
ADMINISTRATIVE COUNCIL MEETING
31 March 2015, 10:30-16:30 hrs
FEANI/ENAAEE premises, Brussels**

36AC/179
Status: 23 June 2015

A/D		By
	<p>9.2 Report on Label Committee (LC) issues</p> <p>The LC Chair, Mr. J.C. ARDITTI gave an outlook of the agenda topics of the next LC meeting on 6 May 2015 in Brussels. This was noted.</p> <p>10. Next AC and GA Meetings: dates and locations 178</p> <p>The AC confirmed the following meeting dates:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 23 June 2015, morning: joint IEA/ENAAEE forum, in Istanbul - 23 June 2015 afternoon: ENAAEE AC meeting, in Istanbul - 17 November 2015, morning: ENAAEE AC meeting, in Brussels - 17 November 2015, afternoon: ENAAEE GA meeting, in Brussels 	AC
22.	<p>This was agreed. More information about the meeting schedule in Istanbul will follow.</p> <p>11. Any Other Business</p> <p>11.1 Continuation and membership of the Standing Committee (SC)</p> <p>At the AC meeting on 19 June 2014, a Standing Committee had been established to assist the President for his tasks. This SC is composed of the ENAAEE President, the two VPs, the Treasurer and Messrs. M. BRIDGEFOOT and J.C. ARDITTI. The AC agreed to confirm the existence of the SC until the end of the President's mandate, i.e. the GA at the end of 2016.</p> <p>12. Close of the Meeting</p> <p>The President closed the meeting thanking the participants for their contributions.</p>	AC
23.	<p>_____</p> <p>Prof. Dr. Bernard REMAUD President</p>	President, VPs, Treasurer, Bridgefoot, Arditti